



State of Arizona  
Janice Brewer – Governor

## Arizona State Board of Massage Therapy

“Protecting the Public’s Health”

1400 West Washington • Suite 300 • Phoenix, AZ 85007 • Telephone 602-542-8604 • FAX 602-542-8804  
Dennis Beye, LMT; Victoria Bowmann, LMT; John Ortega, Public Member  
Diane Pruetz, Public Member; Earl Duskey, LMT; Kathleen Phillips, Executive Director

### MINUTES BOARD MEETING

November 17, 2014 9:00 a.m.  
1400 West Washington St, B1  
Phoenix, AZ 85007

#### 1. Call to Order by Presiding Officer

Victoria Bowmann, Vice Chair, called the meeting to order at 9:15 am.

- A. Roll call of Board members was done to establish a quorum to conduct the meeting.

Board Members present: Victoria Bowmann, LMT, Vice Chair  
Diane Pruetz, Public Member  
Earle Duskey, LMT  
John Ortega, Public Member – arrived at 9:20am

Board Member absent Dennis Beye, Chair

- B. Acknowledgement of presence of Board staff and legal counsel.

Assistant Attorney General: Elizabeth Campbell  
Christopher Munns

Board Staff present: Kathleen Phillips, Executive Director  
Stan Conger, Investigations  
Ellen Boyd, Licensing Administrator

#### Breaks:

10:00 am – 10:05 am

11:17 am – 11:25 am

#### 2. Call to the Public.

None

### 3. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action on Consent Agenda

(Any item under consent may be removed for independent discussion and action by a Board Member.)

A. Approval of Minutes: September 22, 2014 board meeting

B. Approval of 229 Massage Therapy Application(s)

Abelardo Mendoza	Daniela Quijada	Jaynette Wilbur
Abenego Fayah	David Cook	Jennifer Bass
Adriene Nicks	Davina LaGravinese	Jennifer Kilgore
Alec Andsager	Davine Naulty	Jennifer Roland
Alejandra Simental	Deanna Bergeson	Jennifer Rose
Alex Hershberger	Deidra Brown-Impiccini	Jennifer Stromski
Alexis Warden	Derlene Tortice	Jennifer Velez
Alisha Weldon	Desiree Flerchinger	Jenny Caffrey
Alissa Searby	Devin Golladay	Jeremy Ray
Amanda Wellington	Edgar Rios	Jessica Neria
Amy Flume	Edith Cano	Jessica Martinez
Amy Grimsley	Elizabeth Avina	Jesus Padilla
Andrew Olson	Elizabeth Christianson	Johnny Pina
Angelita Huerigo	Elke Schreiber	Jordan Darnell
Anthony Martin	Ericka Aguilar	Joshua Hinderks
Ashley Cavazos	Erin Gerard	Joshua Kurtz
Ashley Darnell	Ernestina Penunuri	Judith Miller
Ashley Elm	Eryca Garcia	Julia Peairs
Beatriz Montes	Eva Dragos	Justin Peters
Betty Anspach	Faith Varnado	Kali Watada
Bianca Llamas	Feng Ba	Karina Rivera
Bliss Nash	Frank Bunevich	Kathleen Norris
Bobbie Smith	Georgette Azizi	Kathryne Huch
Brandi Vanlwarden	Ginger Sebastian	Katrina Gudgeon
Brandon Olsberg	Glenda Stone	Kayla Hines
Brent McDonald	Guadalupe Diaz Ruiz	Kayla Pena
Brittany Bagwell	Gui Qing Liang	Keisha McGee
Brittany Means	Hayley Wagner	Kenneth Young
Caitlin Gill	Heather Kravsnick	Kerrie Wallis
Cassandra Lozano	Heidi Brogdon	Kiera Stroup
Chelsea Hoskyns	Helen Becker	Kierra Bohochik
Cheri Brown	Horace Gilbert	Kirsten Heller
Cherryl Sylvia	Isabel Meyer	Kristen Burns-Norberg
Cheryl Boyd	Jacklyn Ross	Krystal Dean
Cinamon Kimbrough	Jacquelyn Wright	Krystal Vaught
Claire Bernhard	Jae Lee	Kyrsten Schubert
Clarice Santa Cruz	Jaedon Skinner	Leah Howard
Crystal Pitts	James Padgett	Leah Jonas
Crystal West	Jamie Walters	Leah Terry
Cynthia Carrizoza	Janis Tate	Leanna Hammett
Dahlia Pacheco	Jay Boyd	Lellious Howard Jr
Daniel Lindstrom	Jayme Edmier	Leslie Tecun

Ligia Visoan  
Lindsey Baker  
Lisa Kearn  
Lisa Kroack  
Loreena Heinle  
Lorena Luera  
Lori Abel  
Luis Gonzalez  
Luis Molina  
Makayla Castaneda  
Maria Newbold  
Maria Watson  
Mariah Smith  
Marisol Lopez  
Mark Schmisek  
Mary Kane-Walthall  
Mary Karp  
Matthew Martens  
Melody Gillham  
Mi Sim  
Michael Dooley  
Michael Westover  
Michelle Talbot  
Miles Exner  
Monica Muilenburg  
Monica Rhoden  
Muoi Thach  
Naiema Barlow-Allen  
Natasha Torrence  
Nicole Acridge  
Nicole Arnaiz  
Nicole Fisher  
Nicole Lemnah  
Nicole Rogers  
Olivia Hughes

Paige Maurer-Wheeler  
Paige Walberg  
Patricia Camarena  
Pattaraporn Mannarino  
Paul Risley  
Peter Blackwell  
Qicheng Wei  
Rachael Kimmerly  
Rachel Blake  
Rachel Lauren-Bernstein  
Raymond Gundel  
Rebekah Shea  
Rhiannon Platt  
Rita Karavay  
Rita Schulte  
Robert Cisneros Jr  
Robert Lund  
Ross Foree  
Roxana Lehner  
Ruth Lake  
Ryan Aldrete  
Ryan Shaw  
Samantha Murillo  
Samantha Nyland  
Sarah Groleau  
Sarah Lengyel  
Sarah Valenzuela  
Sarah Whittier  
Schatzi Horne  
Scott Boyle  
Sergio Damiani Lopez  
Shawn Hernandez  
Shayla Douglas  
Shelby Wooley  
Shelly Lavender

Sol Manion  
Starla Clarke  
Stephanie Delgado  
Stephanie Ekstrom  
Stephanie Morales  
Stephen Mitchell  
Steven Guzman  
Stevie Anderson  
Tabitha Stutzman  
Takao Ebino  
Talitha Ekama  
Tara Secakuku  
Taylor Menlove  
Taylor Muggleston  
Tiffany Englet  
Toni DeRienzo  
Tori Casarez  
Tracy Walrath  
Trevor Merrill  
Tylan Hadlock  
Tyler Schneider  
Ulises Politron  
Vanessa Fuentes  
Vashti Begay  
Veronica Henry  
Wendie Ryan  
Whitney Langlais  
William Little  
WP Frame Jr  
Xristos Magoulas  
Xueman Xu  
Yareli Arjona  
Yongfang Huang

### C. Approval of Massage Therapy Schools

CA	The Desert Resort School	exp. 06/30/07	70-220 Hwy 111	Ranch Mirage
CA	Somatherapy	exp. 06/30/07	70-225 Hwy 111	Ranch Mirage
CAN	International Academy of Massage	2/26/14 - 2/25/15	380 Forest St	Ottawa Ontario
MI	Naturopathic Inst of Therapies & Education	1/1/1996-6/30/15	503 E Broadway	Mnt Pleasant

**MOTION:** Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board approve 3 (A), (B), and (C).  
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent – 1

### 4. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action on Regulatory Matters

#### A. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action on Cases Voted to Formal Hearings - Motions to Deem

##### 1. **Eva Jie Tian** Case # 14-121

Ms. Tian was present with an interpreter.  
Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.  
Mr. Conger was sworn in.  
Ms Tian was sworn in.  
Ms. Tian addressed the Board.  
Ms. Campbell questioned Mr. Conger.  
Ms. Campbell questioned Ms. Tian.  
Ms. Campbell gave her closing argument.  
Ms. Tian gave her closing argument.

**MOTION:** Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board adopt the findings of fact, amending #1 to only include “touched the massage therapy’s client’s penis”, and to exclude #6.  
Mr. Ortega seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent – 1

**MOTION:** Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board adopt the alleged violations of law as the Board’s Conclusions of Law, excluding #6.  
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent – 1

**MOTION:** Mr. Duskey moved that the Board revoke the license.  
Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

**ROLL CALL VOTE:** Mr. Duskey - aye  
Ms. Pruetz - aye  
Mr. Ortega – aye  
Ms. Bowmann – aye  
Mr. Beye – absent

##### 2. **AiLi Zhang** Case # 14-128

Ms. Zhang was not present.  
Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.  
Ms. Campbell questioned Mr. Conger.  
Ms. Campbell gave her closing argument.

**MOTION:** Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board adopt the findings of fact.  
Mr. Ortega seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent – 1

**MOTION:** Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board adopt the alleged violations of law as the Board's Conclusions of Law.  
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent – 1

**MOTION:** Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board revoke the license.  
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

**ROLL CALL VOTE:**

Mr. Duskey – aye  
Ms. Pruetz – aye  
Mr. Ortega – aye  
Ms. Bowmann – aye  
Chair Beye – absent

**3. Jorge Lozoya** Case # 14-113

Mr. Lozoya was not present.  
Ms. Campbell addressed the Board and asked to grant a motion to deem the case.

**MOTION:** Mr. Duskey moved that the Board grant the state's request to deem.  
Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent – 1

**MOTION:** Mr. Duskey moved that the Board adopt the findings of fact and the conclusions of law.  
Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent – 1

**MOTION:** Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board revoke the license.  
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

**ROLL CALL VOTE:**

Mr. Duskey – aye  
Ms. Pruetz – aye  
Mr. Ortega – aye  
Ms. Bowmann – aye  
Chair Beye – absent

**4. Eric Lombardo** Case # 14-119

Mr. Lombardo was not present.  
MS, the complainant, was present.  
Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.  
MS was sworn in.  
Ms. Campbell questioned MS.  
Ms. Campbell gave her closing argument.  
The Board questioned Mr. Conger  
The Board questioned MS.

**MOTION:** Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board adopt the findings of fact.  
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent – 1

**MOTION:** Mr. Duskey moved that the Board adopt the alleged violations of law as the Board's Conclusions of Law.  
Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent – 1

**MOTION:** Mr. Duskey moved that the Board suspend Mr. Lombardo's license for 1 year. He must complete a total of 15 pre-approved, in class hours consisting of ethics, draping, and communication. These must be completed by his next expiration date in addition to the required 24 hours of CE's. He must appear before this Board to request the suspension be lifted.  
Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

**ROLL CALL VOTE:**

Mr. Duskey – aye  
Ms. Pruetz – aye  
Mr. Ortega – aye  
Ms. Bowmann – aye  
Chair Beye – absent

**5. Jonathon Thompson** Case # 14-100

Mr. Thompson was present.

Ms. Campbell presented a Motion to Continue Hearing from Mr. Thompson's attorney, Thomas Gorman.

Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.

**MOTION:** Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board go to Executive Session to obtain legal advice.  
Ms. Bowmann seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 3  
Nays - 1  
Absent – 1

Executive Session 11:47am – 10:52am

**MOTION:** Mr. Duskey moved that the Board grant the continuance. The case is to be heard on February 23, 2015.  
Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent – 1

**B. Discussion and Possible Action on Request for Rehearing or Review**

**1. Hui Fitzgerald** Case # 14-123

Ms. Fitzgerald was not present.

Ms. Campbell address the Board.

**MOTION:** Mr. Duskey moved that the Board deny a rehearing.  
Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent – 1

**C. Discussion and Possible Action on Board Order**

1. **Jamie Brooks** Case # 12-101  
Ms. Brooks was present and addressed the Board.

**MOTION:** Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board release Ms. Brooks from probation.  
Ms. Bowmann seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 3  
Absent – 2  
(Mr. Ortega stepped out temporarily)

**D. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action on Investigative Reviews**

1. **Joseph Flory** Case # 15-101  
Mr. Flory was not present.  
MC, the complainant, was present.  
Mr. Conger summarized the case.  
The Board questioned MC.

**MOTION:** Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board forward the case to a formal hearing.  
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent – 1

2. **Sarina Yi Yang** Case # 15-108  
Ms. Yang was not present.  
Mr. Conger summarized the case.

**MOTION:** Mr. Duskey moved that the Board forward the case to a formal hearing to include criminal records.  
Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent – 1

3. **Kizzie Bowe** Case # 15-112  
Ms. Bowe was present with counsel, Alane Roby.  
Mr. Conger summarized the case.  
Ms. Roby addressed the Board.  
The Board questioned Ms. Roby.  
BG, the complainant, was present with counsel, Jody Buzicky.  
Ms. Buzicky addressed the Board.  
The Board questioned BG.

**MOTION:** Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board subpoena records.  
Mr. Ortega seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent – 1

4. **Kevin Chau** Case # 15-113  
Mr. Chau nor the complainant were present.  
Mr. Conger summarized the case.

**MOTION:** Ms. Bowmann moved that the Board forward the case to a formal hearing with a provision for a consent agreement.  
Mr. Ortega seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent – 1

**5. Curtis Crawford** Case # 15-106

Mr. Crawford was not present.

Mr. Conger summarized the case.

**MOTION:** Mr. Duskey moved that the Board forward the case to a formal interview and to subpoena court records.

Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent – 1

**6. Stacy Vanorski** Case # 14-109

Ms. Vanorski was not present.

Mr. Conger summarized the case.

**MOTION:** Mr. Duskey moved that the Board forward the case to a formal hearing.

Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent – 1

**7. Christopher Carruthers** Case # 15-114

Mr. Carruthers was present.

Mr. Conger summarized the case.

The Board questioned Mr. Carruthers.

**MOTION:** Mr. Duskey moved that the Board issue an advisory letter to include receipt of evaluation.

Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent – 1

**E. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action on Initial Application or Renewal Application Review**

**1. Lisa Kao** Case #15-105

Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.

**MOTION:** Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board accept the withdrawal of Ms. Kao's application.

Mr. Ortega seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent – 1

**F. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action on Cease and Desist**

**1. Elena L. Garcia**

Mr. Conger reported that Ms. Garcia stated that she is not practicing massage therapy.

**2. Jennifer Cozad**

Mr. Conger reported the Ms. Cozad agreed to stop practicing until she renews her license.

**3. Richard Maranville**

Mr. Conger reported that there has been no response to the letter sent on November 3, 2014.



**5. Administrative Matters**

**A. Massage license status report**

Ms. Phillips reported the status numbers as below:

Active: 10,087

Denied: 32

Pending: 244

Voluntarily Surrendered: 17

Revoked: 40

Closed – App withdrawn and failed to complete: 463

**B. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action on Administrative Matters and Legislative Update**

1. Dates for Board Meetings in 2015

February 23, 2015

March 23, 2015

May 18, 2015

July 27, 2015

September 28, 2015

November 16, 2015

**MOTION:** Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board approve the Board Meeting dates.  
Mr. Ortega seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent – 1

2. Board update – Kathleen Phillips

Board Member Training – January 26, 2015

The board member training will be held at the Department of Administration.

**ADJOURNMENT:** The meeting was adjourned at 12:50 pm.  
The next scheduled Board Meeting is February 23, 2015.