



State of Arizona  
Douglas A. Ducey  
Governor

## Arizona State Board of Massage Therapy

"Protecting the Public's Health"

1400 West Washington • Suite 300 • Phoenix, AZ 85007 • Telephone 602-542-8604 • FAX 602-542-8804  
Victoria Bowmann, LMT; Earl Duskey, LMT; John Ortega, Public Member;  
Diane Pruetz, Public Member; Dennis Beye, LMT; Kathleen Phillips, Executive Director

### MINUTES BOARD MEETING

July 20, 2015 9:30 a.m.  
1400 West Washington St, B1  
Phoenix, AZ 85007

#### 1. Call to Order by Presiding Officer

Victoria Bowmann, Chair, called the meeting to order at 9:39 am.

A. Roll call of Board members was done to establish a quorum to conduct the meeting.

Board Members present: Victoria Bowmann, LMT, Chair  
Earle Duskey, LMT, Vice-Chair  
John Ortega, Public Member  
Dennis Beye, LMT

Board Member absent: Diane Pruetz, Public Member

B. Acknowledgement of presence of Board staff and legal counsel.

Assistant Attorney General: Elizabeth Campbell

Board Staff present: Kathleen Phillips, Executive Director  
Stan Conger, Investigations  
Ellen Boyd, Licensing Administrator

Breaks: 11:31 am – 11:37 am  
1:00 pm – 1:10 pm

#### 2. Call to the Public.

None.

### 3. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action on Consent Agenda

(Any item under consent may be removed for independent discussion and action by a Board Member.)

A. Approval of Minutes: May 18, 2015 board meeting

B. Approval of 251 Massage Therapy Application(s)

Richard	Abisia
Patricia	Adams
Yvonne	Allen
Adrian	Almeraz
Rachel	Alvarado
Jonathan	Amaya
Stefanie	Anderson
Renee	Aragon
Susanna	Atherton
Sara	Atwood
Ashlee	Baker
Tekoa	Barajas
Timothy	Barber
Julie	Baron
Justyne	Barr
Percelia	Batala
Jackie	Bauer
Steve	Beardslee
Amy	Belk
Jenna	Benner
Edwin	Boice
Molly	Bottom
Gail	Bresnahan
Daniel	Brothers
Melissa	Carey
Kenny	Carpenter
Kymishia	Carson
Marcos	Castillo
Ofelia	Castro-Flores
Brittni	Chavez-Molina
James	Chesnik Jr
Katie	Collins
Yvonne	Cook
Pamela	Cook-Foran
Wandee	Cotton
Steven	Cox

Chanel	Craig
Sabra	Crane
Sheri	Crawley
Jazminn	Darling
Clarisa	Davis
Skye	Davis
Ayman	Dawood
Deyna	De la Garza
Jacqueline	Decker
Olivia	Delgado
Nicole	Dicken
Kama	Dickson
Wendy	Drescher
Robert	Duran
Veronica	Durazo
Lacey	Eckstein
Connor	Edwards
Katelan	Edwardson
Deborah	Eggleston
Jessica	Ehler
Stephanie	Escobar
Michael	Escobedo
Angelica	Estrada
Tammy	Evans
Michael	Ewell
Alexandria	Fagan
Blake	Fensler Jr
Brandi	Ferguson
Angela	Ferrell
Adam	Fletcher
Kevin	Flores Guzman
DeArlo	Fowler-Marzec
Ashley	Frederickson
Emily	Funmaker
Michael	Fuski
Jerel	Gaitan

Jill	Gallaher
Ariel	Gallichant
Alyssa	Garcia
Roberto	Garcia
Irma	Garcia Dominguez
Maribel	Garcia-Ornelas
Charlene	German
Jennifer	Gibson
Samantha	Gilbert
Tiana	Gonzalez
Laura	Gothberg
Brandon	Granados
Starlene	Gray
Concetta	Gucwa
Danielle	Gustafson
Lidia	Gutierrez
Manuel	Gutierrez
Brandy	Guzman
Theresa	Hager
Samantha	Hall
Mitchell	Halpin
Angela	Hamblin
Khalil	Hamdan
Danielle	Hannasch
Kathy	Hanson
Candace	Hardy
Kortney	Hargrave
Nathaniel	Harlan
Alane	Harmon
Shyan	Harrison
Stefani	Hayes-Ward
Yabeth	Hernandez
Rhonda	Hill
Rebecca	Hodges
Megan	Hodgins
Cherokee	Hollingworth

Carmen	Houk
Laura	Howe
Chengfeng	Huan
Jeramie	Hughes
Maj-Brith	Jolivet
Mark	Kadlec
Devin	Kalt
Anna	Kemp
Lao	Kemper
Alan	Khoutakoun
Bethany	Kilcup
Bruce	Knutson
Jiao	Kong
Rachel	Korhumel
Colleen	Kossow
Crystal	Kurtz
Jazmin	LeBaron
Jolene	LeForce
Gilbert	Leon
Zhe	<u>Li</u>
Anna	Lichty
Wyatt	Lillis
Rogelio	Limon-Valenzuela
Katharine	Litchfield
Alyssa	Lomnický
Jessica	Lucero
Kingston	Lyon
Amanda	Madsen
Lindsey	Males
Thomas	Martin
Tina	Martinez
Jessica	Mathis
Kimberly	May
Kimberly	McCarthy
Naomi	McCourt
Melissa	McCutcheon
Joseph	McKennon
Rachel	McKnight
Deborah	McMillan
Jayne	Meller

Sydney	Mender
Karla	Mendiola Quinonez
Amber	Michael
Amanda	Miller
Tanna	Miller
Gigi	Moller
Alexander	Moore
Julia	Moore
Martin	Moreno
Alma	Murray
Tiana	Namuo
Jonathan	Nelson
Kim	Nichols
Caith	Norton
Stephanie	Oaks
Catherine	Ohumukini
Linda	Pacheco
Tammy	Paddock
Lauren	Parsons
Kimberly	Pasquariello
Jon	Pelton
Baylee	Pence
Zenaida	Pereyda
Laura	Pfefferle
Priscila	Pilkington
Karyl	Pitts
Brian	Prescott
Maria	Proctor
Weihong	Qing
Cynthia	Quijada
Matthew	Racine
Priscilla	Ramierz
Angelica	Ramirez
Oscar	Ramirez
Regina	Ramirez
Wendy	Ramirez Cardenas
Cynthia	Ramos
Francis	Ramos
Hannah	Rashid
Aaron	Reed

Emily	Ricketts
Javier	Rios
Jenna	Roberts
Gina	Rooney
Holly	Rourke
Thomas	Rowley
Margaret	Ruby
Rosanna	Ruiz
Felicia	Rusz
Lisa	Sainz
Salvador	Salas II
Nicole	Sanchez
Martha	Sanders-Villaraza
Connie	Sarff
Caleb	Schaefer
Vanessa	Scott
Jesenia	Seturino
HeeSun	Shin
Titiana	Shostak-Kinker
Amber	Silverman
Lyla	Sisson
Cocell	Smith
Jennifer	Soderberg
Karian	Sorenson
Mario	Soto
Diane	Spencer
Jennifer	Steinfeld
Tracie	Stephens
Carrie	Straw
Sang Sook	Suh
Xiangyuan	Sun
Yaojun	Sun
Andrew	Taylor
Kenneth	Templeton
Cari	Thome
Doni	Tobola
Melizza	Trevizo
Ryan	Tucker
Hannah	Turner
Jenna	Unlig
Susan	Vanderbeek

Ingrid	Veenema
Rosi	Velez-Deal
Autumn	Vink
Shelia	Vulcan
Robert	Washmon
Annie	Weaver-Bryant
Shana	Weitzman
Sterling	Welch

Janelle	White
Dallas	Wilkie
Katrina	Williams
Nataliya	Winkle
Margo	Wint
Allison	Wisnewski
Paul	Wood
William	Wood

Ze	Wu
Carrie	Wynn
Lauren	Yanez
Thomas	York
Megan	Young
Jennifer	Youngs

### C. Approval of Massage Therapy Schools

CA	Angeles College Downey Adult School Career and Education Center	2009 - 8/31/15	3440 Wilshire Blvd #310	Los Angeles
CA	Santa Ana Beauty College	2013 - 2019	12340 Woodruff Ave	Downey
CA	Santa Ana Beauty College	1/9/06 - 6/30/07	1926 W 17th St	Santa Ana
CA	Santa Ana Beauty College	2010 - 9/2015	1926 W 17th St	Santa Ana
CA	Santa Barbara School of Massage	4/1/1977 - 6/30/2007	1018 Garden St #104	Santa Barbara
CAN	Vancouver School of Bodywork & Massage	12/1/05 - 1/5/16	300-342 Water St	Vancouver
CAN	Vancouver School of Bodywork & Massage		5021 Kingsway	Burnaby
IN	Indiana Therapeutic Massage School	6/12/15 - 6/11/16	7780 Michigan Rd #A & D	Indianapolis
MN	Minnesota School of Business	1/2000 - 8/2008	1401 W 76th St #500	Richfield
NM	Massage Therapy Training Inst	2003 - 2/28/21	303 N Alameda Ave	Las Cruces
PA	Massage Academy of the Poconas	6/5/07 -	753 Phillips St	Stroudsburg
SD	Black Hills Health & Education Center		13815 Battle Creek Rd	Hermosa
SD	SD School of Massage Therapy		902 W 22nd St	Sioux Falls
SD	Sioux Falls Therapeutic Massage & Education Center		4201 S Oxbow	Sioux Falls
SD	Pam's Massage School		1901 W 3rd Ave	Mitchell
SD	Springs Bath House School of Massage		PO Box 1102	Mitchell
TX	J & G School of Massage Therapy	2/24/15 - 2/28/17	7500 Viscount Blvd #C-39	El Paso

**MOTION:** Mr. Beye moved that the Board approve 3 (A), (B), and (C).  
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent - 1

#### 4. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action on Regulatory Matters

##### A. Discussion and Possible Action on Investigative Reviews

###### 1. Mitchell Kinstler Case #15-135

Mr. Kinstler was present with his attorney, Jay Volquadsen.

Mr. Conger summarized the case.

The Board questioned Mr. Kinstler.

**MOTION:** Ms. Bowmann moved that the Board issue a non-disciplinary order for Mr. Kinstler to complete 8 hours of ethics by October 26, 2015. They are to be pre-approved by Board staff and will be in addition to continuing education required for renewal of his license.  
Mr. Beye seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent - 1

###### 2. Christopher Edwards Case #15-137

Mr. Edwards was not present.

Mr. Conger summarized the case.

**MOTION:** Mr. Ortega moved that the Board forward the case to a formal hearing.  
Mr. Beye seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent - 1

###### 3. Andja Rawlings Case #15-111

Ms. Rawlings was present with her attorney, David Williams.

RD, the complainant, was present.

Mr. Williams addressed the Board.

RD addressed the Board.

The Board questioned RD.

The Board questioned Ms. Rawlings.

**MOTION:** Mr. Beye moved that Board dismiss the case.  
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent - 1

###### 4. Yi Jia Yin Case #14-110

Ms. Yin was not present.

Mr. Conger summarized the case.

**MOTION:** Mr. Duskey moved that the Board close the case, noting in her file to re-open the case if Ms. Yin applies for renewal of her license.

Mr. Ortega seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent – 1

Mr. Duskey withdrew his motion.

**MOTION:** Ms. Bowmann moved that the Board forward the case to a formal hearing.  
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent - 1

5. **Crystal Noe** Case #15-134

Ms. Noe was present.

Mr. Conger summarized the case.

Ms. Noe addressed the Board.

The Board questioned Ms. Noe.

Complainants Juniper Campbell, Glenn Grossenbacher, Christine Grossenbacher joined the meeting by telephone on the behalf of G, minor complainant.

**MOTION:** Ms. Bowmann moved that the Board issue a non-disciplinary order for Ms. Noe to complete 8 hours of business and ethics by December 2015. They are to be pre-approved by Board staff and completed in class and are in addition to the continuation education required for renewal. Mr. Ortega seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent – 1

6. **Harrison Kingsley** Case #15-125

Mr. Kingsley was not present.

Mr. Conger summarized the case.

**MOTION:** Mr. Beye moved that the Board forward the case to a formal hearing. Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent – 1

7. **Charles Udvarnoky** Case #15-119

Ms. Phillips addressed the Board.

**MOTION:** Mr. Beye moved that the Board close the case, noting in his file to re-open the case if Mr. Udvarnoky applies for renewal of his license. Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent - 1

**B. Discussion and Possible Action on Cases Voted to Formal Hearings – Motions to Deem**

1. **Kizzie Bowe** Case # 15-112

Ms. Bowe was present with her attorney, Ms. Ortega.

BG, the complainant was present.

Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.

Ms. Ortega addressed the Board.

BG was sworn in.

Ms. Campbell questioned BG.

Ms. Ortega questioned BG.

Ms. Ortega questioned Ms. Bowe.

Ms. Campbell questioned Ms. Bowe.

Antoinette Taylor, witness, was sworn in.

Ms. Ortega questioned Ms. Taylor.

Ms. Campbell questioned Ms. Taylor.

Mr. Vaughn, witness, was sworn in.

Ms. Ortega questioned Mr. Vaughn.

Ms. Campbell questioned Mr. Vaughn.

Ms. Campbell questioned BG.

The Board questioned Ms. Bowe and BG.

**MOTION:** Mr. Beye moved that Board go to Executive Session to obtain legal advice. Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent - 1

Executive Session 2:20 pm – 2:25 pm.

Ms. Campbell gave her closing argument.  
Ms. Ortega gave her closing argument.

**MOTION:** Mr. Ortega moved that Board issue an Advisory Letter regarding mixing professional and personal relationships.  
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

**ROLL CALL VOTE:** Mr. Beye – no  
Mr. Duskey – aye  
Mr. Ortega – aye  
Ms. Bowmann – aye  
  
Ms. Pruetz - absent

2. **Kivi Byrne** Case # 15-115  
Ms. Byrne was not present.  
Her attorney, Kent Nicholas, was not present.  
Ms. Campbell stated that Mr. Nicholas wants to be granted a continuance.

**MOTION:** Mr. Duskey moved that the Board grant the continuance, and stated that this will be the last one granted for Ms. Byrne.  
Ms. Ortega seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent - 1

3. **Stacey Varnarski** Case # 14-109  
Ms. Varnarski was not present.  
Ms. Campbell address the Board, stating that a signed consent agreement had been received for voluntary surrender of Ms. Varnarski's massage license.

**MOTION:** Mr. Beye moved that the Board accept the consent agreement for surrender of the massage license.  
Mr. Ortega seconded the motion.

**ROLL CALL VOTE:** Mr. Beye – aye  
Mr. Duskey – aye  
Mr. Ortega – aye  
Ms. Bowmann – aye  
  
Ms. Pruetz – absent

4. **Antahn Soamsamon** Case # 13-137  
Mr. Soamsamon was not present.  
Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.

**MOTION:** Mr. Beye moved that the Board grant the state's request to deem.  
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent - 1

**MOTION:** Mr. Beye moved that the Board adopt the finding of facts and alleged violations from the complaint and notice of hearing as finding of facts and conclusions of law.

Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent - 1

**MOTION:** Mr. Beye moved that the Board revoke the license.  
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

**ROLL CALL VOTE:** Mr. Beye – aye  
Mr. Duskey – aye  
Mr. Ortega – aye  
Ms. Bowmann – aye  
  
Ms. Pruetz - absent

### **C. Discussion and Possible Action on Application Review**

#### **1. Hai Wang**

Mr. Wang was not present.  
Attorney, Adrian Hall, was present and requested a continuance.  
Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.

**MOTION:** Mr. Beye moved that the Board revisit the case when the application is complete.  
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent - 1

**2. Hui Liu** Case #15-103  
Ms. Liu was not present.  
Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.

**MOTION:** Mr. Ortega moved that the Board revisit the case when the application is complete.  
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent – 1

**3. Katharina Thomas** Case #15-136  
Ms. Thomas was present with her attorney, Julie Benes.  
Mr. Conger summarized the case.  
Ms. Benes requested a continuance.

**MOTION:** Mr. Ortega moved that the Board grant a continuance.  
Mr. Beye seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 4  
Absent – 1

### **5. Administrative Matters**

#### **A. Massage license status report**

Ms. Phillips reported the status numbers as below:  
Active: 10,014  
Denied: 32  
Pending: 167  
Voluntarily Surrendered: 18  
Revoked: 47  
Closed – App withdrawn and failed to complete: 502



**B. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action on Administrative Matters and Legislative Update**

Board update: Ms. Phillips addressed the issue of Board inspections. There is possible legislation for Board inspections of facilities throughout the state. Ms. Phillips discussed the possibility of this Board doing inspections for massage businesses. The Board will consider the idea and discuss it further at the next Board meeting.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting was adjourned at 3:25 pm.  
The next scheduled Board Meeting is September 28, 2015.