



State of Arizona
Douglas A. Ducey
Governor

Arizona State Board of Massage Therapy

"Protecting the Public's Health"

1400 West Washington • Suite 300 • Phoenix, AZ 85007 • Telephone 602-542-8604 • FAX 602-542-8804
Victoria Bowmann, LMT; Earl Duskey, LMT; John Ortega, Public Member;
Diane Pruetz, Public Member; Dennis Beye, LMT; Kathleen Phillips, Executive Director

MINUTES BOARD MEETING

November 16, 2015 9:30 a.m.
1400 West Washington St, B1
Phoenix, AZ 85007

1. Call to Order by Presiding Officer

Victoria Bowmann, Chair, called the meeting to order at 9:30 am.

A. Roll call of Board members was done to establish a quorum to conduct the meeting.

Board Members present: Victoria Bowmann, LMT, Chair
Earle Duskey, LMT, Vice-Chair
Dennis Beye, LMT
Diane Pruetz, Public Member

John Ortega, Public Member, arrived at 9:35 am.

B. Acknowledgement of presence of Board staff and legal counsel.

Assistant Attorney General: Elizabeth Campbell

Board Staff present: Kathleen Phillips, Executive Director
Stan Conger, Investigations
Ellen Boyd, Licensing Administrator

Breaks: 10:07 am – 10:13 am
11:27 am – 11:35 am

2. Call to the Public.

None.

3. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action on Consent Agenda

(Any item under consent may be removed for independent discussion and action by a Board Member.)

- A. Approval of Minutes: September 28, 2015 and August 4, 2015 telephonic Board meeting.
- B. Approval of 174 Massage Therapy Application(s)

Gina	Agee
Angela	Aguilar
Kelly	Alamilla
Taylor	Alexander
Tyler	Allen
Emily	Apodaca
Jessica	Arnold
Peter	Aronov
Julie	Ashmore
Andrea	Autry
Taylor	Bays
Susan	Bearden
Bradison	Belcher
Selina	Benavidez
Breann	Benjamin
Talia	Benson
Cassandra	Berends
Jonathan	Berens
Courtney	Bowman
Keri	Breauchy
Laurence	Brossard
Caitlin	Brown
Donald	Brown
Karen	Bullard
Corinne	Callahan
Clark	Canavan
Marcus	Canestaro
April	Cassity
Kathryn	Cesolini
Amy	Clark
Jason	Cohen
John	Colmenero
Yan Ping	Corley
Thomas	Cote
Jeffrey	Cravath
Ruth	Cubides

Amanda	Davis
Michelle	Dawson
Darrell	Dixon
Paula	Downing
Anthony	Duran
Lori	Durr
Mary	Dutton
Tiffani	Erdman
Sabrina	Esquer
Nicole	Fields
Mary	Foster
Ryan	Frost
Michelle	Garcia
Stephanie	Garnett
Brenda	Giguere
Susan	Glass
Autumn	Grennier
Jorge	Grigalva
Itzel	Grijalva
Nicholas	Grothe
James	Hackett
Heather	Han
Shawnee	Hansen
Taylor	Harbin
Michelle	Haro
Magdalena	Hernandez
Arwin	Hice
Amanda	Hill
Debbie	Hoffman
M	Hope
Julia	Hutchinson
Alex	Jin
Leslie	Johns
Toneva	JoseMaria
April	Jurado
Chelsea	Kaldahl

Keum	Kim
Andrew	Kincaid
Jennifer	Knighton
Laurel	Labistre
Alexander	Laetsch
Joseph	Lang
Kayla	Langeheine
Jenna	Lawlor
Paula	Leadbetter
Jana	Lee
April	Lewis
Dulse	Leyva
Xiaoyan	Liang
Hannah	Linhart
Lauren	Linzie
Qing	Liu
Marilyne	Lombard
Jordan	Lovato
Bluesky	Maekong
Kyle	Marble
Lisa	Marino
Jennifer	Martin
Cassie	Mauch
Marie	McKay
Caitlyn	McKee
Emily	McLemore
Jose	Merida
Ryan	Miller
Tammy	Minnich
Tina	Miranda
Brittany	Molina
Cindy	Monreal
Deborah	Moore
Valarie	Morrell
Wendy	Munoz
Erin	O'Brien

Linda	Olesen
Taylor	Ostrom
Eunhee	Paek
Inyeong	Park
Paige	Parke
Theresa	Payan
Michele	Pedro
Cassandra	Perales
James	Perkins
Robert	Peterson
Jennifer	Phillips
Natalia	Phillips
Monica	Pieleanu
Dominic	Polanco
Michele	Popowchak
Ashley	Powell
Kari	Rasmussen
Kevyn	Reynolds
Amanda	Richards
Klarissa	Rico
Hayley	Rivera
Ciarra	Roberts
Eldon	Robinson

Jesus	Robles
Stephanie	Rodriguez
Catherine	Rueger
Benjamin	Sackreiter
Cristal	Salinas
Shellen	Sandberg
Sara	Sanderson
Ivette	Sandoval Guzman
Maelon	Saress
Hyun	Shin
Destinee	Siyuja
Scott	Smalling
Paul	Smith Jr
Robert	Snodgrass II
Michele	Sosebee
Sally	Springs
Kym	Stine
Morgan	Strong
Elena	Tankevich
Melissa	Templeton
Ryan	Thomas
Erica	Thompson
Myra	Thompson

Daniel	Tittle
Dorlisa	Tom
Labelle	Truong
Cassandra	Waite
Anthony	Walker
Eric	Walker
Stephanie	Walker
Miranda	Warburton
Jeanie	Williams-Hill
Adriann	Willis
Sheila	Wilson
Kellie	Wingate
Alexander	Wolfert
Dina	Wynn
Xing	Xu
Yixuan	<u>Zeng</u>
Jun	Zhang
Yanjie	Zhang
Guangwen	Zhu
James	Zite

C. Approval of Massage Therapy Schools

ST	School Name	Street Address	City	Zip
AR	The Edge School of Massage	1211 W James St	Fayetteville	72703
CA	San Joaquin Valley College	5380 Pirrone Rd	Salida	95368
CA	San Joaquin Valley College	27270 Madison Ave #305	Temecula	92590
CA	San Joaquin Valley College	11050 Olson Dr	Rancho Cordova	95670
CA	San Joaquin Valley College	1700 McHenry Ave	Modesto	95350
CA	San Joaquin Valley College	4580 Ontario Mills Pkwy	Ontario	91764
CA	San Joaquin Valley College	9329 Mariposa Rd	Hesperia	92344
CA	San Joaquin Valley College	215 W 7th St	Hanford	93230
CA	San Joaquin Valley College	295 E Sierra Ave	Fresno	93710
CA	San Joaquin Valley College	201 New Stine Rd	Bakersfield	93309
CA	San Joaquin Valley College	4985 E Andersen Ave	Fresno	93721
CA	American College of Healthcare	11801 Pierce St #100	Riverside	92505
CA	American College of Healthcare	6606 Pacific Blvd #204	Huntington Park	90255
CA	Cinta Aveda Inst	305 Kearny St	San Francisco Richmond Hill,	94108
CAN	Wellsprings College of MT & Esthetics	11160 Yonge St #12	Ontario	L4S1H5

IL	Spa Vargas	4051 E Main St	St. Charles	60174
MO	School of Massage Arts	3322 A.S. Campbell	Springfield	65807
UT	Utah College of MT	143 N State St	Orem	84057

MOTION: Mr. Beye moved that the Board approve 3 (A), (B) and (C).
Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Absent - 1

4. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action on Regulatory Matters

A. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action on Investigative Reviews

1. **Edward Goldman** Case #16-104

Mr. Goldman was present with no attorney.

Mr. Conger summarized the case, and reported that the complainant has withdrawn the complaint.

Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.

Mr. Goldman addressed the Board.

The Board questioned Mr. Goldman.

The Board questioned Mr. Conger.

MOTION: Ms. Pruetz moved that Board go to Executive Session to obtain legal advice.
Mr. Beye seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 5
Nays - 0

Executive Session: 9:45 am – 9:50 am

MOTION: Mr. Beye moved that the Board dismiss the case.
Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 5
Nays - 0

2. **Nancy Bowman** Case #16-1022

Ms. Bowman was present with no attorney.

The complainant was unable to be reached telephonically.

Mr. Conger summarized the case.

Ms. Bowman addressed the Board.

Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.

The complainant was still unable to be reached telephonically.

Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.

The Board questioned Ms. Bowman.

MOTION: Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board dismiss the case.
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 5
Nays - 0

3. **Christopher Stevens** Case #16-103
Mr. Stevens was present with no attorney.
The complainant, MM, was present.
Mr. Conger summarized the case.
Mr. Stevens addressed the Board.
The Board questioned Mr. Stevens.
MM addressed the Board.
The Board questioned MM.

MOTION: Mr. Beye moved that Board forward the case to an informal interview.
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 5
Nays - 0

4. **Abenego Fayah** Case #16-101
Mr. Fayah was present with his attorney, Mr. Lichwala.
The complainant, LS, was present telephonically.
Mr. Conger summarized the case.
The Board questioned LS.
Mr. Fayah addressed the Board.
The Board questioned Mr. Fayah.

MOTION: Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board forward the case to a formal hearing.
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 5
Nays – 0

5. **Mei Juan Zheng-Ciribassi** Case #14-131
Ms. Zheng-Ciribassi was present with her attorney, Mr. Campbell.
Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.

MOTION: Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board forward the case to a formal hearing.
Mr. Ortega seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Absent – 1 (Mr. Beye had stepped out of the meeting.)

6. **Can Ming Liu** Case #16-109
Ms. Liu was not present.
Mr. Conger summarized the case.

MOTION: Mr. Beye moved that the Board forward the case to a formal hearing.
Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 5
Nays – 0

B. Discussion and Possible Action on Cases Voted to Formal Hearings – Motions to Deem

1. **Sarina Yang** Case # 15-108
Ms. Yang was present with her attorney, Mr. Liszewski, and an interpreter.
Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.

MOTION: Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board accept the factual allegation as stipulated by the 2 parties.
Mr. Beye seconded the motion.

Ayes – 5
Nays – 0

Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.
Mr. Liszewski addressed the Board.
Ms. Campbell gave her rebuttal.
Ms. Yang addressed the Board.

MOTION: Mr. Beye moved that the Board adopt the conclusions of law with the exception of #6.
Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

Ayes – 5
Nays – 0

MOTION: Mr. Beye moved that the Board revoke Ms. Yang's license.
Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

Ayes – 5
Nays – 0

ROLL CALL VOTE: Mr. Ortega – aye
Ms. Duskey - aye
Mr. Pruetz – aye
Mr. Beye – aye
Ms. Bowmann – aye

2. **Amber Ward** Case # 15-123
Ms. Ward was not present.
Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.
Mr. Conger addressed the Board.

MOTION: Mr. Beye moved that the Board adopt the findings of fact.
Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 5
Nays -0

MOTION: Mr. Beye moved that the Board adopt the alleged violations of law as the Board's Conclusions of Law.
Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 5
Nays - 0

MOTION: Mr. Beye moved that the Board revoke Ms. Ward's license.
Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

ROLL CALL VOTE:
Mr. Beye – aye
Ms. Pruetz – aye
Mr. Duskey – aye
Mr. Ortega – aye
Ms. Bowmann – aye

3. **Joe Taylor** Case #15-139
Ms. Campbell addressed the Board and asked to grant a motion to deem the case.

MOTION: Mr. Beye moved that the Board grant the state's request to deem.
Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 5
Nays – 0

MOTION: Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board adopt the finding of facts and alleged violations from the complaint and notice of hearing as finding of facts and conclusions of law.
Mr. Ortega seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 5
Nays – 0

MOTION: Mr. Duskey moved that the Board revoke the license.
Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

ROLL CALL VOTE: Mr. Beye – aye
Ms. Pruetz – aye
Mr. Duskey – aye
Mr. Ortega – aye
Ms. Bowmann – aye

3. **Jesse Ferrell** Case # 15-128
Mr. Ferrell and his attorney, Mr. Williams, were present.
The complainant, AP, was present.
Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.
Mr. Williams addressed the Board.
Ms. Campbell questioned AP.
Witness, Mr. Crozier, testified in favor of Mr. Ferrell.
Mr. Williams questioned Mr. Crozier.
Ms. Campbell questioned Mr. Crozier.
The Board questioned Mr. Crozier.
Witness, Ms. Turner, testified in favor of Mr. Ferrell.
Mr. Williams questioned Ms. Turner.
Ms. Campbell questioned Ms. Turner.
Mr. Williams questioned Mr. Ferrell.
Mr. Williams addressed the board.
The Board questioned Mr. Ferrell.
Ms. Campbell questioned AP.
Ms. Campbell gave her closing argument.
Mr. Williams gave his closing argument.
Ms. Campbell gave her rebuttal.

MOTION: Ms. Puret看 moved that the Board adopt the findings of fact.
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Nays -1

MOTION: Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board adopt the alleged violations of law as the Board’s Conclusions of Law.
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Nays - 1

MOTION: Mr. Beye moved that the Board issue an order for Mr. Ferrell to complete a minimum of 20 hours in boundaries and ethics. These hours are to be in addition to the required 24 hours for the renewal of his license. The classes are to be pre-approved by staff, must be completed in a classroom setting, and are to be completed by July 1, 2016.
Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Beye – aye
Ms. Pruetz – aye
Mr. Duskey – aye
Ms. Bowmann – aye
Mr. Ortega – nay

C. Request for Suspension to be lifted.

1. **Cristinel Liciu** Case #14-108
Mr. Liciu was present with no attorney.
Ms. Conger summarized the case.

MOTION: Mr. Beye moved that the Board release Mr. Liciu's license from suspension.
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 5
Nays – 0

5. Administrative Matters

A. Massage license status report

Ms. Phillips reported the status numbers as below:
Active: 10,042
Denied: 32
Pending: 232
Voluntarily Surrendered: 19
Revoked: 49
Closed – App withdrawn and failed to complete: 523

B. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action on Administrative Matters and Legislative Update

1. Approval of 2016 Board Meeting Dates
January 25
March 28
May 23
July 25
September 26
November 14
2. Board update.
Possible consolidation of the Boards were discussed.
The continuing education committee meeting dates were discussed.
The ability to apply for an initial application online is being put in place.
3. Federation update
Mr. Duskey and Mr. Beye reported that a vote was conducted to create a committee to investigate human trafficking.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting was adjourned at 3:10 pm.
The next scheduled Board Meeting is January 25, 2016.