



State of Arizona
Douglas A. Ducey
Governor

Arizona State Board of Massage Therapy

"Protecting the Public's Health"

1400 West Washington • Suite 300 • Phoenix, AZ 85007 • Telephone 602-542-8604 • FAX 602-542-8804
Victoria Bowmann, LMT; Earl Duskey, LMT; John Ortega, Public Member;
Diane Pruetz, Public Member; Dennis Beye, LMT; Kathleen Phillips, Executive Director

MINUTES/draft BOARD MEETING

March 28, 2016 9:30 a.m.
1400 West Washington St, B1
Phoenix, AZ 85007

1. Call to Order by Presiding Officer

Victoria Bowmann, Chair, called the meeting to order at 9:34 am.

- A. Roll call of Board members was done to establish a quorum to conduct the meeting.

Board Members present: Victoria Bowmann, LMT, Chair
Earle Duskey, LMT, Vice-Chair
Diane Pruetz, Public Member
John Ortega, Public Member

- B. Acknowledgement of presence of Board staff and legal counsel.

Assistant Attorney General: Elizabeth Campbell

Solicitor General's Office: Mary Williams

Board Staff present: Kathleen Phillips, Executive Director
Ellen Boyd, Licensing Administrator
Andrew White, Investigator

Breaks: 10:03 am – 10:05 am
11:10 am – 11:15 am
1:43 pm – 1:54 pm
3:10 pm – 3:16 pm

2. Call to the Public.

None.

3. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action on Consent Agenda

(Any item under consent may be removed for independent discussion and action by a Board Member.)

A. Approval of Minutes: January 25, 2016 Board Meeting.

B. Approval of 208 Massage Therapy Application(s)

Janette	Abbott
Sahar	Abdulsattar
John	Aberg-Riger
Benita	Adams
Lakeisha	Agyei
Barbara	Alfer
Gema	Allen
Jessica	Allen
Beatriz	Amaya
Kristopher	Anthony
Monica	Antone
Leah	Araiza
Alex	Averill
Ahlam	Badou
Taylor	Ballantyne
Mary	Baranski
Sarah	Barth
Stephanie	Basurto
Anthony	Bayardo
Mari	Bell
Richard	Bowley
Jacquelyn	Boyd
Kelly	Boyd-Slivers
Tabitha	Bridges
Kenneth	Brown
Joshua	Bryant
Allan	Caballero
Melissa	Cardenas
Laura	Carmona
Johnni	Cassidy
Hayde	Chacon

Karin	Chauvin-Espeleta
Mi	Cho
Anjalique	Christensen
Hanh	Chu
Gwaine	Collins Jr
Colleen	Corrigan
Mihael	Cozma
Melcor	Cruz
Huang	Cui
Perri	Czech
Wardia	Debray
AtinaLuar	Delgado
Britney	Diaz
Shelley	Dvorak
Marissa	Eddolls
Bianco	Espino
Emily	Estes
Dianne	Evans
Mandilynn	Evans
Haiqing	Fan
Anna	Filipski
Katrina	Fisher-Pallanes
Benjamin	Fitzgerald
Daisy	Flores
Margaret	Foltz
Trecia	Forbes-Helton
Elizabeth	Franklin
Felice	Franks
Monserrat	Fuentes-Moreno
Kira	Gaillour-Harrison
Armando	Galaviz

Nancy	Garzon
Rachelle	Geils
Dina	Guzman
Seon	Han
Samara	Hanrahan
Meghan	Hawley
Josephine	Hernandez
Ashley	Herriman
Kristine	Hill
Victoria	Hilton
Patrick	Hinds
Torin	Hodge
Aimee	Holley
Kristina	Horn
Meredith	Hornberger
Micheal	Howard
Llewellyn	Howell
Tommie	Huffman
Steven	Jaggers Jr
Henry	James III
Jessica	Jamison
Brandon	Jetton
Santana	Johns
Deborah	Joya
Andrew	Justice
Christine	Kaibetoney-Begaye
Victor	Kaine
Tristen	Kanani Rosare
Nadene	Kanter
Elizabeth	Kerber
Jonathan	Kershaw

Omy	Keyes
Jared	Kitch
Shelley	Knuffke
Ana	Kohnen
Rebecca	Kopec
Mary	Kuder
Vicktoria	LaRiche
Joseph	Lauricella
Richard	Leach
Hong Joo	Lee
Hun	Lee
Sarah	Leech
Gabrielle	Ligon
Bethany	Lilly
Jihong	Liu
Linda	Liu
Yingqiao	Luo
Sarah	Lynn
Kelly	Mabry
Melinda	Mace
Samantha	Machain
Heather	Mann
Shelbie	Martello
Reyna	Martin
Tracey-Lynn	Martin
Alejandro	Martinez
Rachel	Massie
Suzanne	Massingill
Shea	McCauslin
Orgel	McCoy
Lori	McDonald
Killian	McKeown
Michelle	McNally
Dania	Mejia
Sonya	Mellado
Stacy	Mensingher
Brennan	Micander
Brandy	Miller
Robert	Miller

Marisa	Molina
Yadina	Molina Barrera
Angela	Monteleone
Jesus	Morales
Fernando	Mora-Sanchez
Miranda	Morelli
Robert	Morris
Sara	Moss
Kelsey	Mullins
Nathaniel	Mulnix
Sydney	Murray
Michele	Mutuc
Mariana	Nelson
Amado	Olivarria
Cassidee	O'Quinn
Tracy	Osorno-Hassan
James	Pacheco
Thomas	Palmer
Grace	Park
John	Parker
Diane	Pennacchia
Francisco	Perez
Janci	Petersen
Naomi	Peterson
Jordan	Pettit
Patricia	Piatti-Forlenza
Nicole	Pida
Ryan	Quesenberry
Alexia	Ramirez
Yuliya	Raymer
Marissa	Reece
Chelsea	Reedberry
Dan	Ren
Suying	Ren
Mario	Resek
Chazlee	Reyna
Jeremiah	Reynolds
Joshua	Reynolds
Robin	Richardson

Da'Vante	Riggins
I-Dennisse	Rios-Blood
Allison	Ritchie
Warren	Ross
Rebecca	Sabatini
Michael	Scarfia
Ginger	Schultz
Amanda	Scott
Ryan	Sedar
Theresa	Shoop
Moses	Siregar III
Alexis	Smith
Kali	Smith
Stephanie	Smith
Allison	Sosa
Brendowlyn	Speller
Elizabeth	Stolmeier
Leah	Stowe
La' Tanya	Taylor
Shawn	Terrell
Phoebe	Teskey
Zachary	<u>Timmons</u>
Aubrey	Toler
Luis	Torres
Kamille	Tyree
Enrique	Uzueta
Amy	Waite
Erin	Webb
Heather	Weiss
Xieling	Welch
Candice	Whitaker
Candelaria	Whitfield
Tiffany	Wieland
Carrie	Yakopatz
Jena	Yates
Shallon	Yourist
Shiman	Zhang

C. Approval of Massage Therapy Schools

ST	School Name	Approval Dates	Street Address	City
AZ	Maricopa Skill Center	2013-2020	1245 E Buckeye Rd	Phoenix
AZ	Maricopa Skill Center	2013-2020	2931 W Bell Rd	Phoenix
CA	Rosemead Beauty School	1986 - 5/2017	8531 E Valley Blvd 43141 Business Center Pkwy	Rosemead
CA	Charter College	2012 - 4/30/16	#102	Lancaster
CR	Costa Rica School of Massage Therapy	2/24/14 - 2/24/19	Costade Norte de la Plaza	Costa Rica
IN	Mecca School of Massage	12/19/13 - 12/19/16	6225 Carrollton Ave	Indianapolis
MD	Potomac Massage Training Inst (PMTI)	exp 10/31/2021	8380 Colesville Rd #600	Silver Spring
MI	Lansing Community College	exp 4/2017	515 N Washington Square	Lansing
NV	AMO School	12/1/15 - 11/30/17	5115 Spring Mnt Rd #215	Las Vegas
OH	Youngstown College of Massotherapy	1999-12/2006	14 Highland	Struthers

MOTION: Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board approve 3 (A), (B) and (C).
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Nays - 0

4. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action on Regulatory Matters

A. Discussion and Possible Action on Failure to Complete Board Order

1. **Eric Lombardo** Case #14-119
Mr. Lombardo was present with no attorney.
Ms. Phillips addressed the Board.
Mr. Lombardo addressed the Board.
The Board questioned Mr. Lombardo.
Ms. Phillips addressed Mr. Lombardo.

Clarification was given to Mr. Lombardo regarding continuing education completion.
No Board action was taken.

B. Discussion Consideration and Possible Action on Investigative Reviews

1. **Arturo Escarsega** Case # 16-107
Mr. Escarsega was present with no attorney.
Mr. White summarized the case.
ME, the complainant, was present.
Mr. Escarsega addressed the Board.
The Board questioned Mr. Escarsega.
ME addressed the Board.
The Board questioned ME.

MOTION: Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board move the case to a formal hearing.
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

Ayes – 4
Nays – 0

2. **Wanda Corrales-Madrid** Case #16-105
Ms. Corrales-Madrid was not present.

MOTION: Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board revisit this case when Ms. Corrales-Madrid applies for renewal.
Mr. Ortega seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Nays – 0

3. **Andrea Callinhawk** Case #16-112
Ms. Callinhawk attended the meeting telephonically.
Mr. White summarized the case.
The Board questioned Ms. Callinhawk.
MS, the complainant, was present.
The Board questioned MS.

MOTION: Mr. Ortega moved that Board dismiss the case.
Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Nays – 0

4. **Paul Dean West** Case #16-114
Mr. West was present without his attorney.
Mr. West said that his attorney wants the case moved to a formal hearing.

MOTION: Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board move the case to a formal hearing.
Mr. Ortega seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Nays -0

C. Discussion, Consideration, and Possible Action Regarding Scottsdale Municipal Court Letters of Surrender

1. **Wen Ding** Case #16-123 & **Hong Williams** Case #16-122
Ms. Ding nor Ms. Williams were present.
Their attorney, Mr. Antonio Zuniga was present.
Mr. White summarized the cases.
Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.
Mr. Zuniga addressed the Board.

MOTION: Ms. Pruetz moved that Board go to Executive Session to obtain legal advice.
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Nays - 0

Executive Session: 9:50 am – 10:03 am

MOTION: Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board move the case to a formal hearing.
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Nays -0

D. Discussion and Possible Action on Cases Voted to Formal Hearings – Possible Motions to Deem

1. **Mel Juan Zheng-Ciribassi** Case # 14-131
Ms. Zheng-Ciribassi, her attorney, Mr. Scott Campbell, and an interpreter were present
and were sworn in.
Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.

Mr. Campbell addressed the Board.
Detective, Dustin Hawkinson, was present and was sworn in.
Mr. Campbell addressed the Board.
Ms. Campbell questioned Mr. Hawkinson.
Detective Hawkinson gave his testimony.
Mr. Campbell questioned Detective Hawkinson.

MOTION: Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board go to Executive Session to obtain legal advice.
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Nays - 0

Executive Session: 11:52 am – 12:04 pm

Mr. Campbell resumed questioning Detective Hawkinson.

MOTION: Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board go to Executive Session to obtain legal advice.
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Nays - 0

Executive Session: 12:30 pm – 12:38 pm

Ms. Campbell questioned Detective Hawkinson.
Mr. Campbell questioned Ms. Zheng-Ciribassi.
Ms. Campbell questioned Ms. Zheng-Ciribassi.
The Board questioned Detective Hawkinson.
The Board questioned Ms. Zheng-Ciribassi.
Ms. Campbell gave her closing argument.
Mr. Campbell gave his closing argument.
Ms. Campbell gave her rebuttal.

MOTION: Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board adopt the findings of fact.
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 3
Nays -1

MOTION: Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board adopt the alleged violations of law as the Board's Conclusions of Law.
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 3
Nays - 1

MOTION: Mr. Duskey moved that the Board revoke Mr. Zheng-Ciribassi's license.
Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

ROLL CALL VOTE:
Ms. Pruetz – aye
Mr. Duskey – aye
Mr. Ortega – nay
Ms. Bowmann – aye

2. **Christopher Stevens** Case #16-103

Mr. Stevens was present with no attorney.
NM, complainant, was present.
Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.
NM was sworn in.
Ms. Campbell questioned NM.
Mr. Stevens questioned NM.
Mr. Stevens was sworn in.
Mr. Stevens addressed the Board.
Ms. Campbell questioned Mr. Stevens.
The Board questioned Mr. Stevens and NM.
Ms. Campbell gave her closing argument.
Mr. Stevens gave his closing argument.

MOTION: Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board dismiss the case.
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Nays -0

3. **Howard Yeaman** Case #16-100

Ms. Campbell addressed the Board and asked the Board to grant a motion to deem the case.

MOTION: Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board grant the state's request to deem.
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Nays – 0

MOTION: Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board adopt the finding of facts and alleged violations from the complaint and notice of hearing as finding of facts and conclusions of law.
Mr. Ortega seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Nays – 0

MOTION: Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board revoke the license.
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

ROLL CALL VOTE: Ms. Pruetz – aye
Mr. Duskey - aye
Mr. Ortega – aye
Ms. Bowmann – aye

4. **Rashawn McMillan** Case #15-131

Ms. Campbell addressed the Board and asked the Board to grant a motion to deem the case.

MOTION: Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board grant the state's request to deem.
Mr. Ortega seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Nays – 0

MOTION: Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board adopt the finding of facts and alleged violations from the complaint and notice of hearing as finding of facts and conclusions of law.
Mr. Ortega seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Nays – 0

MOTION: Ms. Pruetz moved that the Board revoke the license.
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

ROLL CALL VOTE: Ms. Pruetz – aye
Mr. Duskey - aye
Mr. Ortega – aye
Ms. Bowmann – aye

5. Administrative Matters

A. Massage license status report

Ms. Phillips reported the status numbers as below:

Active: 10,003

Denied: 31

Pending: 224

Voluntarily Surrendered: 19

Revoked: 58

Closed – App withdrawn and failed to complete: 536

B. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action on Administrative Matters and Legislative Update

1. Board update, including continuing education, legislation, and online licensing.

Mr. Duskey, Ms. Bowmann, and Ms. Phillips will proceed with the continuing education committee. The next meeting will be held on April 8, 2016 at 1:30pm.

The HB 2501 has been pulled.

Online initial licensing should be available soon. Online renewal licensing is in process.

2. Federation update.

Mr. Duskey reported that the Federation will have a meeting on Memorial weekend at the Hyatt downtown. All strategic planning ideas must be submitted by March 31st.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting was adjourned at 3:39 pm.
The next scheduled Board Meeting is May 23, 2016.