



State of Arizona
Douglas A. Ducey
Governor

Arizona State Board of Massage Therapy

"Protecting the Public's Health"

1400 West Washington • Suite 300 • Phoenix, AZ 85007 • Telephone 602-542-8604 • FAX 602-542-8804
Victoria Bowmann, LMT; Earl Duskey, LMT; John Ortega, Public Member;
Diane Pruetz, Public Member; Dennis Beye, LMT; Kathleen Phillips, Executive Director

MINUTES/draft BOARD MEETING

July 20, 2015 9:30 a.m.
1400 West Washington St, B1
Phoenix, AZ 85007

1. Call to Order by Presiding Officer

Victoria Bowmann, Chair, called the meeting to order at 9:39 am.

A. Roll call of Board members was done to establish a quorum to conduct the meeting.

Board Members present: Victoria Bowmann, LMT, Chair
Earle Duskey, LMT, Vice-Chair
John Ortega, Public Member
Dennis Beye, LMT

Board Member absent: Diane Pruetz, Public Member

B. Acknowledgement of presence of Board staff and legal counsel.

Assistant Attorney General: Elizabeth Campbell

Board Staff present: Kathleen Phillips, Executive Director
Stan Conger, Investigations
Ellen Boyd, Licensing Administrator

Breaks: 11:31 am – 11:37 am
1:00 pm – 1:10 pm

2. Call to the Public.

None.

3. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action on Consent Agenda

(Any item under consent may be removed for independent discussion and action by a Board Member.)

A. Approval of Minutes: May 18, 2015 board meeting

B. Approval of 251 Massage Therapy Application(s)

| | |
|----------|---------------|
| Richard | Abisia |
| Patricia | Adams |
| Yvonne | Allen |
| Adrian | Almeraz |
| Rachel | Alvarado |
| Jonathan | Amaya |
| Stefanie | Anderson |
| Renee | Aragon |
| Susanna | Atherton |
| Sara | Atwood |
| Ashlee | Baker |
| Tekoa | Barajas |
| Timothy | Barber |
| Julie | Baron |
| Justyne | Barr |
| Percelia | Batala |
| Jackie | Bauer |
| Steve | Beardslee |
| Amy | Belk |
| Jenna | Benner |
| Edwin | Boice |
| Molly | Bottom |
| Gail | Bresnahan |
| Daniel | Brothers |
| Melissa | Carey |
| Kenny | Carpenter |
| Kymishia | Carson |
| Marcos | Castillo |
| Ofelia | Castro-Flores |
| Brittni | Chavez-Molina |
| James | Chesnik Jr |
| Katie | Collins |
| Yvonne | Cook |
| Pamela | Cook-Foran |
| Wandee | Cotton |
| Steven | Cox |

| | |
|------------|---------------|
| Chanel | Craig |
| Sabra | Crane |
| Sheri | Crawley |
| Jazminn | Darling |
| Clarisa | Davis |
| Skye | Davis |
| Ayman | Dawood |
| Deyna | De la Garza |
| Jacqueline | Decker |
| Olivia | Delgado |
| Nicole | Dicken |
| Kama | Dickson |
| Wendy | Drescher |
| Robert | Duran |
| Veronica | Durazo |
| Lacey | Eckstein |
| Connor | Edwards |
| Katelan | Edwardsen |
| Deborah | Eggleston |
| Jessica | Ehler |
| Stephanie | Escobar |
| Michael | Escobedo |
| Angelica | Estrada |
| Tammy | Evans |
| Michael | Ewell |
| Alexandria | Fagan |
| Blake | Fensler Jr |
| Brandi | Ferguson |
| Angela | Ferrell |
| Adam | Fletcher |
| Kevin | Flores Guzman |
| DeArlo | Fowler-Marzec |
| Ashley | Frederickson |
| Emily | Funmaker |
| Michael | Fuski |
| Jerel | Gaitan |

| | |
|-----------|------------------|
| Jill | Gallaher |
| Ariel | Gallichant |
| Alyssa | Garcia |
| Roberto | Garcia |
| Irma | Garcia Dominguez |
| Maribel | Garcia-Ornelas |
| Charlene | German |
| Jennifer | Gibson |
| Samantha | Gilbert |
| Tiana | Gonzalez |
| Laura | Gothberg |
| Brandon | Granados |
| Starlene | Gray |
| Concetta | Gucwa |
| Danielle | Gustafson |
| Lidia | Gutierrez |
| Manuel | Gutierrez |
| Brandy | Guzman |
| Theresa | Hager |
| Samantha | Hall |
| Mitchell | Halpin |
| Angela | Hamblin |
| Khalil | Hamdan |
| Danielle | Hannasch |
| Kathy | Hanson |
| Candace | Hardy |
| Kortney | Hargrave |
| Nathaniel | Harlan |
| Alane | Harmon |
| Shyan | Harrison |
| Stefani | Hayes-Ward |
| Yabeth | Hernandez |
| Rhonda | Hill |
| Rebecca | Hodges |
| Megan | Hodgins |
| Cherokee | Hollingworth |

| | |
|-----------|------------------|
| Carmen | Houk |
| Laura | Howe |
| Chengfeng | Huan |
| Jeramie | Hughes |
| Maj-Brith | Jolivet |
| Mark | Kadlec |
| Devin | Kalt |
| Anna | Kemp |
| Lao | Kemper |
| Alan | Khoutakoun |
| Bethany | Kilcup |
| Bruce | Knutson |
| Jiao | Kong |
| Rachel | Korhumel |
| Colleen | Kossow |
| Crystal | Kurtz |
| Jazmin | LeBaron |
| Jolene | LeForce |
| Gilbert | Leon |
| Zhe | <u>Li</u> |
| Anna | Lichty |
| Wyatt | Lillis |
| Rogelio | Limon-Valenzuela |
| Katharine | Litchfield |
| Alyssa | Lomnický |
| Jessica | Lucero |
| Kingston | Lyon |
| Amanda | Madsen |
| Lindsey | Males |
| Thomas | Martin |
| Tina | Martinez |
| Jessica | Mathis |
| Kimberly | May |
| Kimberly | McCarthy |
| Naomi | McCourt |
| Melissa | McCutcheon |
| Joseph | McKennon |
| Rachel | McKnight |
| Deborah | McMillan |
| Jayme | Meller |

| | |
|-----------|----------------------|
| Sydney | Mender |
| Karla | Mendiola Quinonez |
| Amber | Michael |
| Amanda | Miller |
| Tanna | Miller |
| Gigi | Moller |
| Alexander | Moore |
| Julia | Moore |
| Martin | Moreno |
| Alma | Murray |
| Tiana | Namuo |
| Jonathan | Nelson |
| Kim | Nichols |
| Caith | Norton |
| Stephanie | Oaks |
| Catherine | Ohumukini |
| Linda | Pacheco |
| Tammy | Paddock |
| Lauren | Parsons |
| Kimberly | Pasquariello |
| Jon | Pelton |
| Baylee | Pence |
| Zenaida | Pereyda |
| Laura | Pfefferle |
| Priscila | Pilkington |
| Karyl | Pitts |
| Brian | Prescott |
| Maria | Proctor |
| Weihong | Qing |
| Cynthia | Quijada |
| Matthew | Racine |
| Priscilla | Ramierz |
| Angelica | Ramirez |
| Oscar | Ramirez |
| Regina | Ramirez |
| Wendy | Ramirez Cardenas |
| Cynthia | Ramos |
| Francis | Ramos |
| Hannah | Rashid |
| Aaron | Reed |

| | |
|-----------|-------------------|
| Emily | Ricketts |
| Javier | Rios |
| Jenna | Roberts |
| Gina | Rooney |
| Holly | Rourke |
| Thomas | Rowley |
| Margaret | Ruby |
| Rosanna | Ruiz |
| Felicia | Rusz |
| Lisa | Sainz |
| Salvador | Salas II |
| Nicole | Sanchez |
| Martha | Sanders-Villaraza |
| Connie | Sarff |
| Caleb | Schaefer |
| Vanessa | Scott |
| Jesenia | Seturino |
| HeeSun | Shin |
| Titiana | Shostak-Kinker |
| Amber | Silverman |
| Lyla | Sisson |
| Cocell | Smith |
| Jennifer | Soderberg |
| Karian | Sorenson |
| Mario | Soto |
| Diane | Spencer |
| Jennifer | Steinfeld |
| Tracie | Stephens |
| Carrie | Straw |
| Sang Sook | Suh |
| Xiangyuan | Sun |
| Yaojun | Sun |
| Andrew | Taylor |
| Kenneth | Templeton |
| Cari | Thome |
| Doni | Tobola |
| Melizza | Trevizo |
| Ryan | Tucker |
| Hannah | Turner |
| Jenna | Unlig |
| Susan | Vanderbeek |

| | |
|----------|---------------|
| Ingrid | Veenema |
| Rosi | Velez-Deal |
| Autumn | Vink |
| Shelia | Vulcan |
| Robert | Washmon |
| Annie | Weaver-Bryant |
| Shana | Weitzman |
| Sterling | Welch |

| | |
|----------|-----------|
| Janelle | White |
| Dallas | Wilkie |
| Katrina | Williams |
| Nataliya | Winkle |
| Margo | Wint |
| Allison | Wisnewski |
| Paul | Wood |
| William | Wood |

| | |
|----------|--------|
| Ze | Wu |
| Carrie | Wynn |
| Lauren | Yanez |
| Thomas | York |
| Megan | Young |
| Jennifer | Youngs |

C. Approval of Massage Therapy Schools

| | | | | |
|-----|--|----------------------|--------------------------|---------------|
| CA | Angeles College | 2009 - 8/31/15 | 3440 Wilshire Blvd #310 | Los Angeles |
| | Downey Adult School Career and Education Center | | | |
| CA | | 2013 - 2019 | 12340 Woodruff Ave | Downey |
| CA | Santa Ana Beauty College | 1/9/06 - 6/30/07 | 1926 W 17th St | Santa Ana |
| CA | Santa Ana Beauty College | 2010 - 9/2015 | 1926 W 17th St | Santa Ana |
| CA | Santa Barbara School of Massage | 4/1/1977 - 6/30/2007 | 1018 Garden St #104 | Santa Barbara |
| CAN | Vancouver School of Bodywork & Massage | 12/1/05 - 1/5/16 | 300-342 Water St | Vancouver |
| CAN | Vancouver School of Bodywork & Massage | | 5021 Kingsway | Burnaby |
| IN | Indiana Therapeutic Massage School | 6/12/15 - 6/11/16 | 7780 Michigan Rd #A & D | Indianapolis |
| MN | Minnesota School of Business | 1/2000 - 8/2008 | 1401 W 76th St #500 | Richfield |
| NM | Massage Therapy Training Inst | 2003 - 2/28/21 | 303 N Alameda Ave | Las Cruces |
| PA | Massage Academy of the Poconas | 6/5/07 - | 753 Phillips St | Stroudsburg |
| SD | Black Hills Health & Education Center | | 13815 Battle Creek Rd | Hermosa |
| SD | SD School of Massage Therapy | | 902 W 22nd St | Sioux Falls |
| SD | Sioux Falls Therapeutic Massage & Education Center | | 4201 S Oxbow | Sioux Falls |
| SD | Pam's Massage School | | 1901 W 3rd Ave | Mitchell |
| SD | Springs Bath House School of Massage | | PO Box 1102 | Mitchell |
| TX | J & G School of Massage Therapy | 2/24/15 - 2/28/17 | 7500 Viscount Blvd #C-39 | El Paso |

MOTION: Mr. Beye moved that the Board approve 3 (A), (B), and (C).
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Absent - 1

4. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action on Regulatory Matters

A. Discussion and Possible Action on Investigative Reviews

1. Mitchell Kinstler Case #15-135

Mr. Kinstler was present with his attorney, Jay Volquadsen.

Mr. Conger summarized the case.

The Board questioned Mr. Kinstler.

MOTION: Ms. Bowmann moved that the Board issue a non-disciplinary order for Mr. Kinstler to complete 8 hours of ethics by October 26, 2015. They are to be pre-approved by Board staff and will be in addition to continuing education required for renewal of his license.
Mr. Beye seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Absent - 1

2. Christopher Edwards Case #15-137

Mr. Edwards was not present.

Mr. Conger summarized the case.

MOTION: Mr. Ortega moved that the Board forward the case to a formal hearing.
Mr. Beye seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Absent - 1

3. Andja Rawlings Case #15-111

Ms. Rawlings was present with her attorney, David Williams.

RD, the complainant, was present.

Mr. Williams addressed the Board.

RD addressed the Board.

The Board questioned RD.

The Board questioned Ms. Rawlings.

MOTION: Mr. Beye moved that Board dismiss the case.
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Absent - 1

4. Yi Jia Yin Case #14-110

Ms. Yin was not present.

Mr. Conger summarized the case.

MOTION: Mr. Duskey moved that the Board close the case, noting in her file to re-open the case if Ms. Yin applies for renewal of her license.

Mr. Ortega seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Absent – 1

Mr. Duskey withdrew his motion.

MOTION: Ms. Bowmann moved that the Board forward the case to a formal hearing.
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Absent - 1

5. **Crystal Noe** Case #15-134

Ms. Noe was present.

Mr. Conger summarized the case.

Ms. Noe addressed the Board.

The Board questioned Ms. Noe.

Complainants Juniper Campbell, Glenn Grossenbacher, Christine Grossenbacher joined the meeting by telephone on the behalf of G, minor complainant.

MOTION: Ms. Bowmann moved that the Board issue a non-disciplinary order for Ms. Noe to complete 8 hours of business and ethics by December 2015. They are to be pre-approved by Board staff and completed in class and are in addition to the continuation education required for renewal. Mr. Ortega seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Absent – 1

6. **Harrison Kingsley** Case #15-125

Mr. Kingsley was not present.

Mr. Conger summarized the case.

MOTION: Mr. Beye moved that the Board forward the case to a formal hearing. Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Absent – 1

7. **Charles Udvarnoky** Case #15-119

Ms. Phillips addressed the Board.

MOTION: Mr. Beye moved that the Board close the case, noting in his file to re-open the case if Mr. Udvarnoky applies for renewal of his license. Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Absent - 1

B. Discussion and Possible Action on Cases Voted to Formal Hearings – Motions to Deem

1. **Kizzie Bowe** Case # 15-112

Ms. Bowe was present with her attorney, Ms. Ortega.

BG, the complainant was present.

Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.

Ms. Ortega addressed the Board.

BG was sworn in.

Ms. Campbell questioned BG.

Ms. Ortega questioned BG.

Ms. Ortega questioned Ms. Bowe.

Ms. Campbell questioned Ms. Bowe.

Antoinette Taylor, witness, was sworn in.

Ms. Ortega questioned Ms. Taylor.

Ms. Campbell questioned Ms. Taylor.

Mr. Vaughn, witness, was sworn in.

Ms. Ortega questioned Mr. Vaughn.

Ms. Campbell questioned Mr. Vaughn.

Ms. Campbell questioned BG.

The Board questioned Ms. Bowe and BG.

MOTION: Mr. Beye moved that Board go to Executive Session to obtain legal advice. Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Absent - 1

Executive Session 2:20 pm – 2:25 pm.

Ms. Campbell gave her closing argument.
Ms. Ortega gave her closing argument.

MOTION: Mr. Ortega moved that Board issue an Advisory Letter regarding mixing professional and personal relationships.
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

ROLL CALL VOTE: Mr. Beye – no
Mr. Duskey – aye
Mr. Ortega – aye
Ms. Bowmann – aye

Ms. Pruetz - absent

2. **Kivi Byrne** Case # 15-115
Ms. Byrne was not present.
Her attorney, Kent Nicholas, was not present.
Ms. Campbell stated that Mr. Nicholas wants to be granted a continuance.

MOTION: Mr. Duskey moved that the Board grant the continuance, and stated that this will be the last one granted for Ms. Byrne.
Ms. Ortega seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Absent - 1

3. **Stacey Varnarski** Case # 14-109
Ms. Varnarski was not present.
Ms. Campbell address the Board, stating that a signed consent agreement had been received for voluntary surrender of Ms. Varnarski's massage license.

MOTION: Mr. Beye moved that the Board accept the consent agreement for surrender of the massage license.
Mr. Ortega seconded the motion.

ROLL CALL VOTE: Mr. Beye – aye
Mr. Duskey – aye
Mr. Ortega – aye
Ms. Bowmann – aye

Ms. Pruetz – absent

4. **Antahn Soamsamon** Case # 13-137
Mr. Soamsamon was not present.
Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.

MOTION: Mr. Beye moved that the Board grant the state's request to deem.
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Absent - 1

MOTION: Mr. Beye moved that the Board adopt the finding of facts and alleged violations from the complaint and notice of hearing as finding of facts and conclusions of law.

Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Absent - 1

MOTION: Mr. Beye moved that the Board revoke the license.
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

ROLL CALL VOTE: Mr. Beye – aye
Mr. Duskey – aye
Mr. Ortega – aye
Ms. Bowmann – aye

Ms. Pruetz - absent

C. Discussion and Possible Action on Application Review

1. Hai Wang

Mr. Wang was not present.
Attorney, Adrian Hall, was present and requested a continuance.
Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.

MOTION: Mr. Beye moved that the Board revisit the case when the application is complete.
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Absent - 1

2. Hui Liu Case #15-103
Ms. Liu was not present.
Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.

MOTION: Mr. Ortega moved that the Board revisit the case when the application is complete.
Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Absent – 1

3. Katharina Thomas Case #15-136
Ms. Thomas was present with her attorney, Julie Benes.
Mr. Conger summarized the case.
Ms. Benes requested a continuance.

MOTION: Mr. Ortega moved that the Board grant a continuance.
Mr. Beye seconded the motion.

VOTE: Ayes – 4
Absent – 1

5. Administrative Matters

A. Massage license status report

Ms. Phillips reported the status numbers as below:
Active: 10,014
Denied: 32
Pending: 167
Voluntarily Surrendered: 18
Revoked: 47
Closed – App withdrawn and failed to complete: 502

B. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action on Administrative Matters and Legislative Update

Board update: Ms. Phillips addressed the issue of Board inspections. There is possible legislation for Board inspections of facilities throughout the state. Ms. Phillips discussed the possibility of this Board doing inspections for massage businesses. The Board will consider the idea and discuss it further at the next Board meeting.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting was adjourned at 3:25 pm.
The next scheduled Board Meeting is September 28, 2015.