# Arizona State Board of Massage Therapy



State of Arizona

Janice Brewer – Governor

"Protecting the Public's Health"

1400 West Washington • Suite 300 • Phoenix, AZ 85007 • Telephone 602-542-8604 • FAX 602-542-8804 Dennis Beye, LMT; Victoria Bowmann, LMT; John Ortega, Public Member Diane Pruetz, Public Member; Earl Duskey, LMT; Kathleen Phillips, Deputy Director

### MINUTES BOARD MEETING

September 24, 2012 10:00 a.m. 1400 West Washington St, B1 Phoenix, AZ 85007

#### 1. Call to Order by Presiding Officer

Mr. Beye, Chair, called the meeting to order at 10:01 am.

A. Roll call of Board members was done to establish a quorum to conduct the meeting.

Board Members present: Dennis Beye, Chair, LMT

Victoria Bowmann, LMT, Vice Chair

Diane Pruetz, Public Member

Earl Duskey, LMT

Board Members absent: John Ortega, Public Member

(Mr. Ortega arrived at 10:15)

B. Acknowledgement of presence of Board staff and legal counsel.

Assistant Attorney General:

Asst. Attorney General

Solicitor General Office: Chris

Elizabeth Campbell

Chris Munns

Board Staff present: Kathleen Phillips, Deputy Director

Stan Conger, Investigations

Ellen Boyd, Licensing Administrator

Breaks were taken at: 10:45 am – 10:55 am 11:59 am – 12:08 pm 1:18 pm – 1:25 pm

#### 2. Call to the Public.

None

#### 3. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action on Consent Agenda

(Any item under consent may be removed for independent discussion and action by a Board Member.)

- A. Approval of Minutes: July 23, 2012 board meeting
- B. Approval of Massage Therapy Application(s) 7/12/2012 9/14/2012

Aguilar, JoselynCunningham, JenniferGraminski, MatthewLangton, EvelynOlivas, PaolaAguilar, MayraDay, JodiGraper, JudithLantz, ZhimeiOrth, PetraAlford, KarenDeemer, KellyGrimmett, SawanaLaymon, ZacharyOstapuk, Kyle

Allen, Brandi DeHaven, Kate Grove, Kathy Lesczynski, Elizabeth Owen, Marvin Palacios, Stephanie Almaguer, Ernesto DeLynne, Jessica Guzman, Rosalva Levine, Kenneth Almonte, Francisco Dempsey, Amanda Halterman, Cori Lewis, Shovonne Palmer, Danielle Austin, Kortnee Deng, HongYu Hanner, Melissa Li, Xiaohong Pan, Lin Ying Austin, Robin DeWitt, Jodie Hardridge, Thomas Lin, Ping Park, Rebecca Avalos, Randy Diamondstein, Amy Hatfield IV, Benjamin Lindsey, Linda Parker, Janice Badilla, Margaret Ding, Wen Hausman, Renee Lister, Andrew Patey, Kelly Barker, Christopher Dionne, Jennifer Hegrenes, Avery Lochner, Caroline Pegueros, Stephanie Begay, Alexandrea Dowell, Melissa Henderson, Gene London, Sari Pelletier-Butler, Paula Begay, Lori Duarte, Lizette Heredia, Vanessa Lopez, Angel Pierson, Leslie Bell, Bonnie Edgington, Perri Hernandez, Adrianna Lopez, Jessica Portney, Barrie Eichler, Peter Hernandez, Theresa Bell, Domingue Luciano, Kendra Powell, Sandra Bickford, Ashley Emery, Thomas Herron, Bobby Martineau, Erika Pugh, Jessica Hickcox, Theresa Rawlins, Jacob Biggs, Julie Estes, Tonya Martinez, Lucy Blanco, Jessica Fairbanks, Alyssa Hickey, Erin Matesich, Melissa Richards, Nicole Bolgren, Les Fairchild, Cory Hicks, Chantel Matus, Marki Richardson, Mackenzie Boyer, Martin Favata, Debra Highsmith, Tiffany May, Sharon Richardson, Megan Bracamonte, David Felix, Davina Higuera, Alicia McCoy, Sean Richter, Jordan Bradshaw, Kyle Finch, Jessica Hilgedick, Angela McGee, Daniel Rincon, Rachel Braly, Naana Fisher, Karisa Hines, Felicity McGowan, Kimberly Rockwood, Minsoon Branscomb, Kara Fleming, Alicia Hobby, Sarah McGrath, Ashley Ross, Kyle Brown, Liza McGrew, Ramon Flores, Antonia Hopkins, Kerenza Rovie, Janelle Brown, Trinity McMahon, Debbie Ruiz, Bianca Frank, Tracy Hoye, Robert Buckallew, Jeremy Frech, Jacqueline Hussey, Sandra Meza, Stephanie Ruiz, Jessica Buie, Caesar Mila. Joffre Ruiz, Vincent Fu, Mei Xia Hysong, Jeff Burgess, Vanita Fullerton, Jodie Irwin, Michelle Miller. Alexander Rumzis, Jing Yi Burrell. Leroy Gaillard, Melba Jablonski, April Miller, Kathleen Salzman, Samantha Bush. Elizabeth Galaviz, Claudia Janssen, Jennifer Molina, Viviana Sanchez, Trevor Butka, GuanQuan Gao, YingHua Jenkins, Nicole Molina, Yessica Sandoval, Elizabeth Calderon, Monica Garcia, Alma Jiminian, Yvam Montiel, Leticia Sands, Nancy Calvillo Magdaleno, Garcia, Elsie Johnson, Fred Sawick Allen, Barbara Heraclio Morey, Jennifer Garcia, Tina Carrier, Jason Johnson, Marig Morris, Dorinda Scarborough, Lorna Gardea, Lorraine Schaub-Oneill, Kristina Cho, Vivian Joseph, Bethany Naber, Melanie Chouinard, Hillary Schoeb, Peter George, Lisa Kartchner, Chanel Nash, Latavia Clinger, Danielle Giacobbi, Dan Khalsa, Siri-Dya Navarro, Mirella Schonhardt, Drew Colgrove, Rebecca Newman, Day Sego, Richard Godoy, Lorena King, Kyl Colomo, Desiree Gonzalez, Janette Kirsch, Beverly Nickerson, Abby Seifert, Mary Spoerry, Robert Zheng, MeiRong Velasquez, Dominica Stevens, Sherry Zahgotah, Julius Villasenor, Raquel Stevick, Heather Zepeda, Melissa Vogel, April Stockwell, Nancy Zhao, Xiao Yun Walker, Kiesha Stroman, Kiley Knapp, Nicole Wang, Juan Struber, Jared Knowlton, Rachel Ward, Yesenia

Tarango, Anjelica	Koperski, Jason	Warnecke, Lori
Taylor, Philip	Kuhn, Ellen	Watson, Daniel
Temple St John, Traci	Lam, Laura	Weaver, Benjamin
Thomas, Nicholas	Nong, Jian Fang	Weng, Hua Jin
Thursby, Stephanie	Norman, Shaun	Wildstein, Heather
Tirums, Erik	Norris, Noelle	Williams, Joanna
Tom, Walter	Oglesby, Tracy	Williamson, Amber
Tong, Siying	Olivas, Gilbert	Wilson, Tyler
Tucker, Katie	Serna, Sandra	Wirthlin, Timothy
Urenda, Maria	Shaw, Angela	Wong, Donald
Usmiller, Samantha	Shultis, Tara	Wu, Wei
Valles, Ann	Silversmith, Nicholas	Wyatt, Lynsie
Vargas, Cindy	Simpson, Shari	Xue, HuaYu
Vazquez, Julio		Yazzie, Naomi Yonan, Nancy Zaqar, Sue

## C. Approval of Massage Schools

ST	School Name	Approval Dates	Street Address	С
ΑZ	Arizona School of Integrative Studies	2/23/12 +	639 N 6th Ave	Tucson
CA	California School of Medical Sciences	11/1/1984 - 11/8/2005 closed	291 S Lacienega Blvd #200	Beverly Hills
CA	California School of Modern Sciences	11/1/1984 - 11/8/2005 closed	291 S Lacienega Blvd #200	Beverly Hills
CT	Branford Hall Career Institute	1997 - 12/31/2012	995 Day Hill Rd	Windsor
FL	The Humanities Center School of Massage	Mar-85	3565 Cypress Terrace	Pinellas Park
GA	Atlanta Beauty & Barber Academy	2009 - 5/2012	6088 Buford Hwy	Doraville
GA	Academy of Somatci Healing Arts		6251 Smithpointe Dr	Norcross
IL	The Body Therapy Center & School of Massage	2/1/12 - 6/30/13	4 Executuve Woods Ct	Swansea
IN	Lewis School of MT	11/14/1994 - 11/13/1995	3400 Michingan St	Hobart
ND	Sister Rosalind Gefre School of Professional Massage	8/2002 - now closed	Fargo Campus	West St. Paul
ND	Career Schools College of Technology	8/2002 - now closed	Fargo Campus	West St. Paul
NJ	Somerset School of MT - Cortiva	10/03 - 10/08 closed	180 Centennial Ave	Piscataway
NJ	Somerset School of MT - Cortiva	2001-2004	7 Cedar Grove Ln	Somerset
VA	Med Spa	7/1/04 - 11/10/10 closed	800 Moorefield Park Dr #307	Richmond
VA	Medical Careers Inst / Med Spa	7/1/04 - 11/10/10 closed	1001 Omni Blvd #200	Newport News
VA	Medical Carreers College / Med Spa	7/1/04 - 11/10/10 closed	1001 Omni Blvd #200	Newport News
WA	Everest College	closed 1/21/10	4905 Pacific Hwy East #3A	Fife
WI	East West Healing Arts Inst	moved in 2006 to Normandy Lane	702 N Blackhawk Ave	Madison

MOTION:

Ayes – 4 VOTE: Absent – 1

#### 4. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action of Regulatory Matters

A. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action on Application Review

1. Leslie Johns

Mr. Conger summarized the case. Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.

**MOTION:** Ms. Bowman moved to allow Ms. Johns to withdraw her application.

Mr. Ortega seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 5

Nays - 0

B. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action on Formal Hearings

1. **Ping Jiang** Case #11-107 Exp. Date 08/30/13

Ms. addressed the Board and entered exhibits 2 - 4.

The Board accepted the exhibits.

**MOTION:** Ms. Pruetz moved to adopt the findings of facts.

Ms. Bowman seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes -5

Nays - 0

**MOTION:** Ms. Bowman moved to accept the conclusions of law.

Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes -5

Nays - 0

**MOTION:** Ms. Bowman moved to revoke the license.

Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

ROLL CALL VOTE: Ms. Bowman: Aye

Mr. Ortega: Aye Ms. Pruetz: Aye Mr. Duskey: Aye Chair Beye: Aye

Chair Beye called for a break at 10:45 am.

The meeting reconvened at 10:55 am.

2. **Chad Massena** Case #11-116 Exp. Date 05/03/2013

Ms. Campbell addressed the Board, presenting a consent agreement from Tracey

Westerhauser Mr. Massena's attorney.

**MOTION:** Ms. Pruetz moved to reject the consent agreement.

Ms. Bowman seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes -5

Nays - 0

CK, the complainant, was sworn in by the court recorder.

CK gave her testimony.

Ms. Campbell entered exhibits.
The Board accepted the exhibits.

Ms. Westerhauser requested a break at 11:24 am.

The meeting reconvened at 11:26 am.

CK was guestioned by Ms. Westerhauser and by the Board.

Ms. Westerhauser called Marlee Simms.

Ms. Simms was sworn in by the court recorder.

Ms. Westerhauser questioned Ms. Simms.

Ms. Westerhauser called Susan Ernst to testify.

Ms. Ernst was sworn in by the court recorder.

Ms. Westerhauser questioned Ms. Ernst.

Ms. Westerhauser rested the case for the defense.

Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.

**MOTION:** Ms. Pruetz moved to adopt the findings of facts.

Mr. Ortega seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes -5

Nays - 0

**MOTION:** Ms. Pruetz moved to accept the conclusions of law.

Mr. Ortega seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes -5

Nays - 0

**MOTION:** Ms. Pruetz moved to revoke the license.

Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

ROLL CALL VOTE: Mr. Ortega: Aye

Ms. Bowman: Aye Ms. Pruetz: Aye Mr. Duskey: Aye Chair Beye: Aye

C. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action on Investigative reviews

1. **Jon Lehman** Case #11-121 Exp. Date: 05/31/2013

Mr. Conger summarized the case.

EP, the complainant, testified by telephone. The Board guestioned EP and Mr. Lehman

**MOTION:** Mr. Duskey moved to move the case to a formal hearing.

Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes -4

Abstain – 1

2. **Kenneth Ware** Case #11-110 Exp. Date: 06/03/2013

Mr. Conger summarized the case.

The complainant, YW, was questioned by the Board.

**MOTION:** Ms. Pruetz moved to move the case to a formal hearing.

Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

**VOTE**: Ayes – 5

Nays - 0

3. **Xoan Burroughs** Case #12-120 Exp. Date: 06/15/2013

Mr. Conger summarized the case.

Ms. Campbell addressed the Board.

Ms. Burroughs addressed the Board.

**MOTION:** Ms. Bowman moved to move the case to a formal hearing..

Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 5 Navs – 0

4. **Stephen Burton** Case #12-121 Exp. Date: 12/14/2013

Mr. Conger summarized the case. The Board questioned Mr. Burton

The Board questioned GS, the complainant.

**MOTION:** Mr. Duskey moved to move the case to a formal investigation.

Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 5

Nays - 0

D. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action on Investigative reviews regarding plea agreements related to prostitution.

1. **Jennie Sharfner** Case #12-112 MT-13782 Exp. Dates: 11/11/2011

Reyna Perez-Duran Case #12-109
 Laura Walden Case #12-100
 Jamie Brooks Case #12-101
 Phoebe Conklin Case #12-103
 Amber Conley Case #12-104
 Alicia Culbert Case #12-105
 Exp. Date: 04/07/2011
 Exp. Date: 07/08/11
 Exp. Date: 07/08/11
 Exp. Date: 07/08/11
 Exp. Date: 03/31/12

8. **Dawn Davis** Case #12-106 Exp. Date: 05/13/12

9. **Sandra Hass** Case #12-108 Exp. Date: 03/02/13

10. Maristela Hoodspith Case #12-110 Exp. Date: 11/04/12

11. **Vanessa Odom** Case #12-111 Exp. Date: 04/28/14 12. **Angelica Valdivieso**Case #12-114 Exp. Date: 11/19/11 13. **Rebecca Webb** Case #12-115 Exp. Date: 02/07/11

14. Amanda Yu Case #12-116 Exp. Date: 10/28/10

**MOTION:** Ms. Bowman moved to move the above cases 1 - 14 to a formal hearing.

Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

**VOTE**: Ayes – 4

Nays - 0

15. **Fontaine Grijalva** Case #12-107 Exp. Date: 04/26/12

Mr. Conger summarized the case.

**MOTION:** Ms. Bowman moved to move the case to a formal hearing.

Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes -5

Navs - 0

E. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action of Request for Board Order extension of time to complete board order.

1. **Robrina Cole** Case #11-111 Exp. Date: 09/17/2012

Mr. Conger summarized.

**MOTION:** Ms. Bowman moved to extend the date of the Board Order completion to December 31, 2012.

Mr. Ortega seconded the motion.

**VOTE**: Ayes -5

Nays - 0

F. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Action on Regulatory Matters

1. Renewal Application

a. Bobbie Jo Johnson

Mr. Conger summarized.

**MOTION:** Ms. Bowman moved to open a complaint regarding the wire fraud conviction.

Ms. Pruetz seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes -5

Nays - 0

**MOTION:** Ms. Bowman moved to renew the license without prejudice and without waiving the Board's ability

to take action if and when necessary. Mr. Ortega seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes -5

Nays – 0

#### 5. Discussion and Consideration and Possible Action on administrative Matters

A. Massage License Status

Ms. Phillips updated the Board on the license status to date.

Active: 10,184 Denied: 30 Pending: 197

Voluntarily Surrendered: 10

Revoked: 24

Closed – App withdrawn and failed to qualify: 321

B. Report on alleged violations by unlicensed persons.

Mr. Conger reported on the following alleged violations.

1. Kelly Donaldson

Mr. Conger stated that all letters sent to Mr. Donaldson were returned.

2. Health and Enjoy Massage Parlor

Mr. Conger stated that this was turned over to Homeland Security.

- C. Discussion and Consideration of Possible Action of Administrative Matters and Legislative Updates
  - 1. Board Update
    - a. Discussion and Consideration of separation of massage Board from the Naturopathic Board

Chairman Beye stated that the Massage Board has no Executive Director at this time, and that the Massage Board has no say in who the Naturopathic Board hires. Chair Beye recommended that the Boards separate.

**MOTION:** Ms. Pruetz moved to have Ms. Phillips pursue the separation of the Boards.

Mr. Duskey seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Ayes – 5

Nays – 0

b. Sunset Review

Ms. Phillips reported that the Sunset Review was submitted on August 15, 2012.

c. Budget Report

Ms. Phillips reported that the Budget Report was submitted on August 15, 2012.

d. Naturopathic Board Update

1. Executive Director Position Status.

Ms. Phillips stated that the Executive Director applications are being reviewed by a committee.

2. FSMTB update

Ms. Bowman reported that there is a Federation meeting to be held this upcoming weekend.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting was adjourned at 1:43 pm. The next scheduled meeting is November 26, 2012.